Institutional Effectiveness and Institution Set Standards

Sonya Christian
President, Bakersfield College

Louise Jaffe
Trustee, Santa Monica College
Chair, California Community College Trustees

California Community College League
Excellence in Trusteeship Program Regional Training
Bakersfield College
May 9, 2014
Section I:
THE CONTEXT
Competing Markets, Connected World, Globalization

Signal “Beeps”
College Scorecard

College Scorecards in the U.S. Department of Education’s College Affordability and Transparency Center make it easier for you to search for a college that is a good fit for you. You can use the College Scorecard to find out more about a college’s affordability and value so you can make more informed decisions about which college to attend.

To start, enter the name of a college of interest to you or select factors that are important in your college search. You can find scorecards for colleges based on factors such as programs or majors offered, location, and enrollment size.

Search for a college by name...

Choose from the following options to begin searching for colleges of interest to you by:
Each Higher Ed Institution
Measured by
✓ Cost
✓ Graduation Rate
✓ Loan Default Rate
✓ Median Borrowing
✓ Employment (in construction)
The average net price for undergraduate in-state students per year. Net price is what undergraduate students pay after grants and scholarships (financial aid you don’t have to pay back) are subtracted from the institution’s cost of attendance.

### White House College Scorecard Cost of Education

- Bakersfield College: $3,625
- Cabrillo College: $7,851
- Cerro Coso: $7,201
- College of the Sequoias: $2,813
- CSU Bakersfield: $6,781
- Merced College: $3,979
- Porterville college: $2,824
- San Joaquin Delta College: $9,388
- San Joaquin Valley College Bakersfield: $16,347
- Taft: $7,945
- Antelope Valley College: $6,661
Response to the data, media pressures, and performance

Judging Good and Bad Data
Response to the data, media pressures, and performance

Judging Good and Bad Data
Response to the data, media pressures, and performance

Judging Good and Bad Data
Patients with different levels of need

Urgent Care Priority
From “The Chronicle of Higher Education”

College Completion

80% First Generation

80% Pre-Collegiate
Regional Accreditation Agencies:
It is all about fulfilling the mission

Northwest Commission on Colleges and Universities

1.A.2 The institution defines mission fulfillment in the context of its purpose, characteristics, and expectations. Guided by that definition, it articulates institutional accomplishments or outcomes that represent an acceptable threshold or extent of mission fulfillment.

Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges

1.B.3 The institution published institution-set standards, for student achievement, appropriate to its mission, and assesses how well it is achieving them in pursuit of continuous improvement.
One-minute paper

What was the most surprising or unexpected idea you heard so far in the presentation?
Section II: Accreditation: A trustee’s perspective on the role of the board
ACCJC says the primary purpose of Accreditation is to foster student learning and student achievement.
How?

According to ACCJC

An effective institution

• Ensures resources, programs, and services support student learning and achievement

• Ensures academic quality and continuous improvement
  • ongoing assessment of learning and achievement

• Pursues institutional excellence and improvement
  • ongoing, integrated planning and evaluation
Four Standards Work Together

Standard I
- Mission, Academic Quality, Institutional Effectiveness and Integrity

Standard II
- Student Learning Programs and Services

Standard III
- Resources

Standard IV
- Leadership and Governance
Standard I

Institution demonstrates strong commitment to a mission that emphasizes student learning and achievement

– Using analysis of quantitative and qualitative data, the institution continuously and systematically
  • Evaluates
  • Plans
  • Implements, and
  • Improves the quality of its educational programs and services.
How is this demonstrated?

How does the institution demonstrate that commitment?

How does the Board of Trustees demonstrate that commitment?
How does the Board of Trustees demonstrate that commitment?

In my opinion!
Trustee Tools of the Trade
Trustee Tools of the Trade

- Calendar
- Vision and Mission
- Goals and Priorities
- Agendas
- Scheduling/Planning Processes
- Budgets
- Board Policies
- Evaluation of CEO
- Other?
These processes work together
Accreditation Team Recommendation
(2010)

To meet the standards, the team recommends that the college evaluate the efficacy of the current staffing model for the institutional research function with a goal of providing timely, in-depth analysis of effectiveness measures and other key institutional metrics to move the college toward the goal of becoming a culture of evidence (Standards I.B.3, I.B.4, I.B.6, I.B.7, II.A.1.c, II.A.2.e, II.A.2.f, II.A.2.g, and II.B.3).
Vision

Santa Monica College will be a leader and innovator in learning and achievement. ...will foster its core values: knowledge, intellectual inquiry, research-based planning and evaluation, .....
Board Goals and Priorities

Our Commitment to Access, Quality, Innovation, Equity and Sustainability

Educational Advancement and Quality

1. Support a culture of evidence to monitor and improve institutional effectiveness and student progress.
CONSENT AGENDA: HUMAN RESOURCES

RECOMMENDATION NO. 8 ACADEMIC PERSONNEL

Requested Action: Approval/Ratification
Reviewed by: Sherri Lee-Lewis, Dean, Human Resources
Approved by: Marcia Wade, Vice-President, Human Resources

ADMINISTRATIVE REORGANIZATION

The following actions implement personnel adjustments in the existing administrative structure.

ESTABLISH
Dean, Student Success Initiatives
Associate Dean, Grants
Associate Dean, Student Life

UPGRADE/RETITLE
Hannah Lawler, Dean, Institutional Research
Roberto Gonzalez, Dean, Student Success Initiatives
Laurie McQuay Peninger, Associate Dean Grants
## Agendas and Scheduling

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Board Meeting</th>
<th>Report to the Board</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>January</td>
<td>Global Citizenship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February</td>
<td>Emergency Preparedness; Board Study Session</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March</td>
<td>Strategic Initiatives: GRIT and I³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>Community and Government Relations (include PAC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td>Institutional Effectiveness – Dashboard/Scorecard, Student Success Initiatives Superintendent’s Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>Special Programs/Health and Psych Services Post Retirement Employee Benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July</td>
<td>Board Self-Study: Self-Assessment, Goals and Priorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August</td>
<td>Emeritus College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September</td>
<td>Budget Hearing and Adoption, Distance Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October</td>
<td>Enrollment Development, Financial Aid, Grants, Outreach, Resource Development/Foundation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Agendas and Scheduling

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Board Meeting</th>
<th>Report to the Board</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>January</td>
<td>Global Citizenship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February</td>
<td>Emergency Preparedness; Board Study Session</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March</td>
<td>Strategic Initiatives: GRIT and I³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>Community and Government Relations (include PAC)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| May           | **Institutional Effectiveness – Dashboard/Scorecard, Student Success Initiatives**  
|               | Superintendent’s Evaluation |
| June          | Special Programs/Health and Psych Services  
|               | Post Retirement Employee Benefits |
| July          | Board Self-Study: Self-Assessment, Goals and Priorities |
| August        | Emeritus College |
| September     | Budget Hearing and Adoption, Distance Education |
| October       | Enrollment Development, Financial Aid, Grants, Outreach, Resource Development/Foundation |
The BOT is aware of and can give input into the development of college initiatives
Different projects and processes come to the BOT’s attention through the year.
Master Plan for Education

2013-2014 INSTITUTIONAL OBJECTIVES

• Institutional Objectives, 2013-2014 (#1-#9)
• 2013-2014 Institutional Objectives Related to Planning Documents
Addenda
to Master Plan for Education

• Program Review Planning Summary, Spring and Fall 2012
• **Board of Trustees Goals and Priorities, 2013-2014**
• Academic Senate Objectives, 2013-2014
• Seven-Year Study of Institutional Objectives Mapped to Strategic Initiatives and Level of Completion
• **Presentation/Reports/Actions at Board of Trustees Meetings Related to the Strategic Initiatives and College Priorities, 2007-2008 –2012-2013**
• Career and Educational Facilities Master Plan 2010 Update Executive Summary
• Technology Objectives, 2013-2014
• DPAC Summary of Actions, 2012-2013
Presentations/Reports/Actions at Board of Trustees Meetings
2007-2008 – 2012-2013

STRATEGIC INITIATIVES
GRIT (Growth, Resilience, Integrity and Tenacity)
I$^3$ (Institutional Imagination Initiative)

CONTINUED COLLEGE PRIORITIES

- Basic Skills Initiative
- Global Citizenship
- Sustainable Campus
- Career Technical Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of Board Meeting</th>
<th>Major Presentation/Report/Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>May 7, 2013</td>
<td>Superintendent’s Report: SMC Named Winner of Annual Energy and Sustainability Award*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 5, 2013</td>
<td>Update: GRIT*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 15, 2013</td>
<td>Report: Global Citizenship Initiative*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2, 2012</td>
<td>Report: Workforce and Economic Development*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 6, 2012</td>
<td>Action: Energy Service Contract*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 5, 2012</td>
<td>Report: Campus Sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 5, 2012</td>
<td>Report: Basic Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 5, 2012</td>
<td>Action: Contract with Big Blue Bus (renewal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 3, 2012</td>
<td>Action: Contract for Promotion-Editor Certificate and Degree (Promo Pathway) Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 5, 2012</td>
<td>Report: Digital Media Programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Report: Campus Bicycle Parking Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 4, 2011</td>
<td>Update: Career Technical Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 6, 2011</td>
<td>Report: Global Citizenship Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 7, 2011</td>
<td>Update: Campus Sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 3, 2011</td>
<td>Report: Basic Skills Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Institutional Objective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#1</td>
<td>To develop definitions and templates for planning processes and outcomes assessment to ensure data interpretation and planning recommendations align based on consistent standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2</td>
<td>To allocate resources sufficient to support the ongoing maintenance of technology, equipment, and facilities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3</td>
<td>To incorporate flexibility in all facilities planning and resource allocation processes to allow for nimble responses to future changes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4</td>
<td>Develop tools to assess students' level of engagement in the education process and use assessment data to look at the relationship between student engagement and retention, perseverance, and student success.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5</td>
<td>To further implement the Institutional Imagination Initiative (I^3) by demonstrating acknowledgment of and support for innovative thinking, first by identifying current creative projects/initiatives in progress.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6</td>
<td>To conduct a quantitative study examining the external variables impacting the College's performance relative to the Institutional Effectiveness Dashboard, including the identification of variables that can be controlled by the College, in order to deepen institutional understanding of the factors that affect student success and appropriately direct efforts to improve institutional performance.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Objective 4**

Develop tools to assess students' level of engagement in the education process and use assessment data to look at the relationship between student engagement and retention, perseverance, and student success.

**Responsible Area(s)**
- Academic Affairs
- Student Affairs
- Enrollment Development
- Academic Senate
- DPAC

### Map to Institutional Learning Outcomes Supporting Goals

|-------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------------------|

- Addresses the following College Priorities and Strategic Initiatives
  - ☑ Basic Skills
  - ☑ Global Citizenship
  - ☑ Sustainable Campus
  - ☑ Career Technical Education
  - ☑ GRIT
  - ☑ Institutional Imagination (I)

- Relates to the following recommendations and objectives:
  - ☑ Board of Trustees Goals and Priorities
  - ☐ Program Review Recommendations
  - ☑ Academic Senate Objectives
  - ☐ Other (please indicate)  

**Methods to Accomplish the Objective and Anticipated Outcomes**: In the spring of 2013, the College adopted ILO #5: Students will demonstrate a level of engagement in the subject matter that enables and motivates the integration of acquired knowledge and skills beyond the classroom. During the 2013-2014 academic year, the institution will seek to effect widespread awareness of the outcome and assist faculty and staff as they adapt the outcome (in the form of SLOs and UOs) for use in their units, programs and departments. This work will be done in conjunction with the Academic Senate's Institutional Effectiveness, Program Review, Curriculum and Department Chairs Committees. The key assumption underlying the outcome is that if students can identify long-range goals and purposes in their lives they are more likely to succeed in school and beyond. The College has developed common questions to assist faculty and staff as they seek to help students identify their goals. These questions will be displayed on banners and posters across the SMC campuses, and on the “Got GRIT?” webpage. Students are invited to share their responses on Twitter, Facebook or Instagram and tag them with #gotgrit. Some of the best answers will be shared at [www.smc.edu/gotgrit](http://www.smc.edu/gotgrit) in hopes of motivating and inspiring all SMC students to identify and achieve their goals.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimated Cost:</th>
<th>Funding Source:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☑ Existing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INSTITUTIONAL OBJECTIVES 2013-2014</td>
<td>Program Review Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. To develop definitions and templates for planning processes and outcomes assessment to ensure data interpretation and planning recommendations align based on consistent standards.</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. To allocate resources sufficient to support the ongoing maintenance of technology, equipment, and facilities.</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. To incorporate flexibility in all facilities planning and resource allocation processes to allow for nimble responses to future changes.</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. To incorporate flexibility in all facilities planning and resource allocation processes to allow for nimble responses to future changes.</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. To further implement the Institutional Imagination Initiative (I³) by demonstrating acknowledgment of and support for innovative thinking, first by identifying current creative projects/initiatives in progress.</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ARTICLE 1200  ROLE OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

BP 1270  Board Self-Evaluation

The Board of Trustees shall hold an annual self-evaluation as part of the summer Study Session on a mutually agreed upon date.

Purpose

No less than once a year the Board shall evaluate the functioning, strengths and weaknesses of the Board and identify specific functions working well and those needing improvement.

Methodology

The methodology will be determined by the Board of Trustees each year based on the priorities of the institution.

Elements of Consideration

- To assess the strengths and weaknesses of the Board as a whole.
- To determine the effectiveness of the performance of the trustees in achieving the District's goals.
- To determine the effectiveness of the policies established by the Board.
- To assess accomplishments relative to the Vision, Mission and Goals of the District.

The results of the discussion will provide the basis for the Board to develop its Goals and Priorities to address the needs of the college for the next year.
BP 1280 Evaluation of the Superintendent/President

The Board of Trustees shall hold an annual evaluation of the Superintendent/President by June 1st each year at a special meeting scheduled on a mutually agreed upon date.

Each member of the Board will individually rate the Superintendent’s performance on the following criteria:

Standard Leadership Criteria

- Educational Advancement and Quality
- Fiscal Health and Internal Operations
- Community and Government Relations (Local/State/National)
- Facilities and Sustainability
- Partnership with the Board of Trustees

Annual Performance Criteria

The performance criteria will be drawn each year from goals and priorities identified by the Board of Trustees.
Evaluation of Superintendent/President, 2013-2014

Please rate the Superintendent/President in key functional areas. Please provide comments to improve the performance of the Superintendent/President in specific functions of the job.

* Required

Educational Advance and Quality

1. Support a culture of evidence to monitor and improve institutional effectiveness and student progress. (Goal 2013-2014) *

1 2 3 4 5

strongly disagree ○ ○ ○ ○ ○ strongly agree

2. Institutionalize initiatives that are effective in improving student success, with an emphasis on improving basic skills mastery in mathematics and English Language Arts, and strengthening students’ non-cognitive skills (GRIT), to achieve more equitable outcomes. (Goal 2013-2014) *

1 2 3 4 5

strongly disagree ○ ○ ○ ○ ○ strongly agree
CEO Evaluation is Closed Session
Board’s work should be woven into the fabric of the institution
One-minute paper

What was the most interesting or useful idea you heard so far in the presentation?
Section III: Developing Institution Set Standards
The strategy map at Bakersfield College
**STRATEGIC GOALS**

- **STUDENT SUCCESS**
  Become an exemplary model of student success by developing and implementing best practices

- **PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT**
  Provide relevant, timely professional growth opportunities to enhance the effectiveness of our employees and institution

- **COMMUNICATION**
  Enhance collaboration, consultation, and communication within the college and with external constituents.

- **FACILITIES, INFRASTRUCTURE & TECHNOLOGY**
  Improve maintenance of college facilities and infrastructure

- **OVERSIGHT & ACCOUNTABILITY**
  Improve oversight, accountability, sustainability, and transparency in all college processes

- **INTEGRATION**
  Implement and evaluate existing major planning processes

---

**STRATEGIC INITIATIVES**

- **Student Learning**
  A commitment to provide a holistic education that develops curiosity, inquiry and empowered learners

- **Student Progression and Completion**
  A commitment to reduce the time for students to complete educational goals

- **Collaboration and Partnerships**
  A commitment to engage in collegewide and community activities.

- **Fiscal Sustainability**
  A commitment to incorporate 21st century technologies and processes to strengthen the long-term fiscal sustainability.

- **Engagement, Peer Learning and Study Series**
  A commitment to creating a learning organization dedicated to advancing out individual and institutional knowledge and creativity

---

**BENCHMARKS DATA STRANDS**

- SLOs/Assessment
- ARCC
- Operational Data
- Perception Surveys/CCSSE
The framework of the institutional score card

https://prod.cms.bakersfieldcollege.edu/scorecard
A preview on the development of efficiency metrics
9. Efficiency: Average FTES Generated Per Student

Metric Definition:

Average FTES generated among credit students enrolled each year (= Total FTES / Headcount)

- 1.0 means that all students took a course load that is considered full-time
Data on Average FTES Generated Per Student
(From 2013 State of the System Report)

Year | FTES
--- | ---
2008/09 | 0.473
2009/10 | 0.496
2010/11 | 0.520
2011/12 | 0.519
2012/13 | 0.533
10. Efficiency: FTES Generated Per Scorecard Success Outcome

Metric Definition:

Number of FTES generated to obtain a “high order outcome” by the cohort starting the first-time, followed for six years.

* Cohort and outcomes included in the calculation are same as for the Scorecard completion rate
Formula

For each cohort:

\[
\text{Total FTES generated by the cohort during the 6-year period} \div \text{Total number of outcomes attained by the cohort during the 6-year period}
\]
Data on FTES Generated Per Scorecard Success Outcome

* Only cohorts with complete (6 years worth) data are displayed
We can monitor progress each year, comparing cohorts

* Only recent cohorts w/ incomplete (3-5 years worth) data are displayed

Year 1 | Year 1-2 | Year 1-3 | Year 1-4 | Year 1-5 | Year 1-6
-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------
44.3   | 38.8    | 29.3    | 24.3    | 9.8     | 6.1     | 4.8

- 08/09 cohort
- 09/10 cohort
- 10/11 cohort

* Not available
Useful Links

Bakersfield College Scorecard
https://prod.cms.bakersfieldcollege.edu/scorecard

Chancellor’s Office Datamart
http://datamart.cccco.edu/DataMart.aspx

BC Habits of the Mind
http://www.bakersfieldcollege.edu/habits-of-mind/

BC Student Success
http://www.bakersfieldcollege.edu/student-success/
Sonya Christian
President
http://www.bakersfieldcollege.edu/president/
sonya.christian@bakersfieldcollege.edu

Louise Jaffe
Trustee, Santa Monica College
Chair, California Community College Trustees
louisecjaffe@gmail.com